

INTENTIONAL RHYME IN VERGIL AND OVID

W. M. CLARKE

Louisiana State University

Is rhyme in ancient poetry intentional, or is it merely the inevitable result of agreement in an inflected language? Ancient commentators leave no doubt that intentional rhyme played a part in classical prose, particularly in ornamenting the conclusions of clauses.¹ According to Cicero, rhyming conclusions produce symmetry and rhythm: *Formae vero quaedam sunt orationis, in quibus ea concinnitas est ut sequatur numerus necessario. Nam cum . . . quae similiter cadunt verba verbis comparantur, quidquid ita concluditur, plerumque fit ut numero cadat.* (*Orat.* 65.220). Rhythmical conclusions of clauses are described as having been taken over from poetry by Isocrates or Gorgias (*Orat.* 52.174 f.).² As a factor in rhythmical conclusions, rhyme may likewise have originated in poetry. In a significant passage Aristotle writes that equality of clauses (*parisôsis*) may be achieved by a similarity of entire words at the beginnings of clauses, or by a similarity of final syllables (or entire words) at the ends of clauses (*Rhet.* 1410A).³ Both his examples of beginnings, however, contain rhyming (not repeated) words⁴—and both are drawn from poetry:

¹ *Homoeoteleuton*, the similarity of endings, is discussed—always with reference to prose—by the *Auct. ad Her.* 4.20.28, 22.32; by Demetrius 26–29; and by Quintilian 9.3.75 ff. (with subdivisions and additional terminology); and by a number of lesser authorities. Cicero, *De or.* 3.54.206, mentions among many figures of speech the use of words “*quae similiter desinunt aut quae cadunt similiter.*” Describing epideictic elaboration, he gives as one of its results “*ut pariter extrema [verba] terminentur eundemque referant in cadendo sonum.*” (*Orat.* 12.38)

² Cf. *De or.* 3.44.174: *Namque haec duo musici, qui erant quondam idem poetae, machinati ad voluptatem sunt, versum atque cantum . . . Haec igitur duo, vocis dico moderationem et verborum conclusionem, quoad orationis severitas pati possit, a poetica ad eloquentiam traducenda duxerunt.*

³ Cf. Demetrius 25.

⁴ Besides the repetition of words, Quintilian (9.3.45) considers acceptable the use of similar inflectional forms for consecutive beginnings of clauses.

ἀγρὸν γὰρ ἔλαβεν ἀργὸν παρ' αὐτοῦ (Aristophanes, Edmunds 649)

δωρητοὶ τ' ἐπέλοντο παράρρητοί τ' ἐπέεσσιν. (Il. 9.526)

Despite the implications of these passages, many modern scholars have found it difficult to believe in the existence of intentional rhyme in the poetry of Greece and Rome. It is agreed that very old charms and jingles feature intentional rhyme,⁵ but in classical poetry rhyme is often described as fortuitous.⁶ According to Norden, rhyme in the high classical Roman period was incidental. Like the rhyme recommended for prose by rhetoricians it was used for rhetorical purposes and sparingly at that. The best poets were reluctant to use it at all.⁷

Since the ancient critics did not discuss rhyme in poetry, scholars have found no objective means to demonstrate that such rhyme might not be merely coincidental. Defenses of intentional rhyme have usually been based on subjective convictions; they have been opposed

⁵ Cf. Cato, *Agr.* 160: *Motas vaeta daries dardares astataries dissunapiter*; and Varro, *Rust.* 1.2.27: *terra pestem teneto, salus hic maneto*.

⁶ Cf. E. Wölfflin, "Der Reim im Lateinischen," *Archiv für lateinische Lexicographie* 1 (Leipzig 1884) 350; H. J. Rose, *A Handbook of Greek Literature* (New York 1960) 279 note 77; L. P. Wilkinson, *Golden Latin Artistry* (Cambridge 1963) 32 f. Some scholars accept as intentional an occasional couplet. Cf. H. T. Johnstone, "Rhymes and assonances in the Aeneid," *CR* 10 (1890) 9-13; and K. F. Smith, *The Elegies of Albius Tibullus* (New York 1913) 199. "Leonine" rhyme (named for a twelfth-century French poet and notable in Latin hexameter and pentameter verse) is more often defended as intentional than other rhyme; cf. R. A. Hornsby, *Reading Latin Poetry* (Norman 1967) 33: "In Latin poetry of the classical period, rhyme was generally avoided except for special effects such as [et simulant fessos curvata cacumina somnos (Statius, *Silv.* 5.4.4)] where the rhyme emphasized by the caesura binds the two words together." This type of rhyme is very common in elegy, e.g.:

Divitias alius fulvo sibi congerat auro
et teneat culti iugera multa soli. (Tibullus 1.1 f.)

Cf. E. Eichner, *Bemerkungen über den metrischen und rhythmischen Bau, sowie über den Gebrauch der Homoeoteleuta in den Distichen des Catull, Properz und Ovid* (Gnesen 1875); and K. Zelzer, "Zum Reim in der römischen Elegie," *WS* 79 (1966) 465-77. Internal rhyme of the leonine type is sometimes accepted by scholars as intentional, while end rhyme in successive verses is described as positively avoided; cf. N. I. Herescu, *La poésie latine* (Paris 1960) 179. Other scholars, on the contrary, call end rhyme intentional and leonine rhyme fortuitous; cf. R. G. Austin, "Virgilian assonance," *CQ* 23 (1929) 46-55. Austin was later to attribute much of the rhyme in Roman poetry to "a natural taste for jingles" (his commentary on *Aeneid* 4.55 [Oxford 1963]). Internal rhyme has recently been defended as intentional in the *Odes* of Horace by Otto Skutsch, "Rhyme in Horace," *BICS* 11 (1964) 73-78. Skutsch argues that Horace rhymes only on syntactically related words.

⁷ E. Norden, *Antike Kunstprosa* (Berlin 1898) 1. 841.

by those who point out that an inflected language will inevitably produce a great quantity of rhyme in any case, and that we have no reason to believe that the poets designed much or any of the rhyme in Latin poetry.

I submit, however, that an objective means does exist to demonstrate that rhyme in Latin verse was intentional, and in fact was employed in at least two long poems on a large scale. Ancient rhetorical theory of pauses and punctuation provides the necessary clue.⁸ Aristotle makes an important comment on this particular subject; in his discussion of the paeon, he remarks that the period of this meter should end in a long syllable, and that the end should be clear—not because of the scribe (*ton graphea*) or the marginal punctuation mark (*tên paragraphên*)—but because of the rhythm (*ton rhythmôn*) (*Rhet.* 1409A). Or as Cicero, dealing with prose, points out, the Greeks intended that clausulae, not weariness or scribes' marks, should provide punctuation: *Interspirationis enim, non defatigationis nostrae neque librariorum notis, sed verborum et sententiarum modo interpunctas clausulas in orationibus esse voluerunt* (*De Or.* 3.43.173). Neither Aristotle nor Cicero specifically state that rhyme may be used to mark punctuation in this way. But we saw earlier that Cicero and Aristotle both give rhyme a part to play in the rhythmical conclusions and beginnings of clauses. Read together, these passages clearly imply that rhyme in the opinion of both ancient critics could play a role in emphasizing major sense pauses.

I believe that Vergil and Ovid have throughout their longest poems placed internal and other rhymes for this purpose in the conclusions and beginnings of clauses. These rhymes occur specifically in clauses preceding and following major sense pauses. Since, as we shall see, analysis of the rhyme in the *Aeneid* and *Metamorphoses* reveals an extremely high degree of association between rhyme and sense pauses, we have good reason to suspect that this rhyme is not coincidental but planned.

The present study consists of an analysis of the entire *Aeneid* and *Metamorphoses* in which I made a record of all internal rhyme (i.e., rhyme within a single verse) and consecutive rhyme (i.e., rhyme in

⁸ For the theory of the clausula, see H. Bornecque, *Les clausules métriques latines* (Lille 1907); for the bibliography, M. G. Nicolau, *L'origine du "cursus" rythmique et les débuts de l'accent d'intensité en latin* (Paris 1930) and A. Primmer, *Cicero Numerosus: Studien zum antiken Prosarhythmus* (Wien 1968).

succeeding verses in the same metrical position). By "rhyme" I mean instances where two or more words end in the same vowel or vowel-consonant sound.⁹ Apart from the fact that *homoeoteleuton* constitutes the kind of rhyme discussed by the ancient commentators to whom I have referred, I confined my study to this kind of rhyme because it seemed the most obvious and considerable type in both poems. In order to avoid any ambiguity in the results of my analysis, I did not consider words to rhyme which end in any sort of elision, nor did I consider repeated words to rhyme.¹⁰

An example of "internal rhyme" occurs in *Aeneid* 1.8:

Musa, mihi causas memora quo numine laeso . . .

where *quo* rhymes with *laeso*. Internal rhyme may occur elsewhere in the hexameter as well—*Meta.* 1.130:

in quorum subiere locum fraudesque dolusque

Aen. 12.845:

Dicuntur geminae pestes cognomine Dirae

Meta. 13.693:

agmen femineum, iugulo dare pectus aperto

An example of "consecutive rhyme" is found in the opening verses of the *Aeneid*:

Arma virumque cano, Troiae qui primus ab oris
Italiam fato profugus Laviniaque venit

where *cano* in v. 1 rhymes with *fato* in v. 2 in the same metrical position. Likewise, consecutive rhyme occurs in the opening verses of the *Metamorphoses*:

In nova fert animus mutatas dicere formas
corpora: di, coeptis (nam vos mutastis et illas)

⁹ In this study I have accepted the distinctions between sounds, including those between long and short vowels, made by W. Sidney Allen, *Vox Latina* (Cambridge 1965). I have also regarded diphthongs in each case as single sounds.

¹⁰ On the basis of the research presented here I can neither confirm nor deny that a deliberate role was assigned to such words by Latin poets. The repetition of entire words, and even phrases, is acknowledged by the commentators as a rhetorical figure used in prose.

in *Aen.* 2.40 f.:

Primus ibi ante omnis magna comitante caterva
Laocoon ardens summa decurrit ab arce

in *Meta.* 15.630 f.:

auxilium caeleste petunt mediamque tenentis
orbis humum Delphos adeunt oracula Phoebi

Or internal and consecutive rhyme may both appear in a sequence of verses, as they do in *Meta.* 1.1 f. and in *Aen.* 2.40 f. above.

In both the *Aeneid* and the *Metamorphoses* most rhyming words end in certain metrical positions in the hexameter: in fact, the repeated use by both poets of a few caesurae and diaereses increases the likelihood that most words will begin and end at certain verse breaks.¹¹ In both poems most internally rhyming words end before the penthemimeral caesura and at the end of the verse.

tu regere imperio populos, Romane, memento (*Aen.* 6.851)

iussit et ambitae circumdare litore terrae (*Meta.* 1.37)

The next commonest positions are those before the hephthemimeral caesura and at the end of the verse.

tantum infelicem nimium delexit amicum (*Aen.* 9.430)

Victor Abantiades patrios cum coniuge muros (*Meta.* 5.236)

The next commonest in the *Aeneid*, but least common in the *Metamorphoses*, are the positions before the trihemimeral and hephthemimeral caesurae.

obiecit? Quae causa fuit consurgere in arma (*Aen.* 10.90)

Admotis Athamanas aquis accendere lignum (*Meta.* 15.311)

Those least used in the *Aeneid* are the positions before the bucolic diaeresis and at the end of the verse. In the *Metamorphoses* these

¹¹ It is rare in either poem for more than two rhyming words to end before verse-breaks in any one verse. There are, however, more than twice as many instances in the *Metamorphoses* of three such words in a verse than there are in the *Aeneid*. Cf. *Aen.* 2.183; 3.381, 630; 4.703; 5.306, 554, 561; 8.682; 10.202, 449, 481, 775; 11.234, 279, 305, 666 (three words in each verse); *Meta.* 1.266, 316, 559; 2.197; 3.159; 4.143, 765; 5.462; 7.852; 8.333; 9.476; 11.197, 517; 12.248; 13.99, 206, 349, 791, 870; 14.273; 15.119, 160, 213, 246, 364, 754, 757, 758 (three words in each verse); 5.422; 8.673; 9.223; 13.185; 15.520 (four words in each verse).

positions are used more often than those before the trihemimeral and hephthemimeral caesurae.

Albanique patres atque altae moenia Romae (*Aen.* 1.7)

candida purpureum simulatas inficit undas (*Meta.* 10.596)

In both poems most consecutively rhyming words end at the end of the verse.

Tu coniunx, tibi fas animum temptare precando.

Perge, sequar." Tum sic excepit regia Iuno: (*Aen.* 4.113 f.)

In nova fert animus mutatas dicere formas

corpora: di, coeptis (nam vos mutatis et illas) (*Meta.* 1.1 f.)

The next commonest position is that before the penthemimeral caesura.

qualia nunc hominum producit corpora tellus;

ille manu raptum trepida torquebat in hostem (*Aen.* 12.900 f.)

illic et nebulas, illic consistere nubes

iussit et humanas motura tonitrua mentes (*Meta.* 1.54 f.)

The next commonest, before the hephthemimeral caesura.

Primus ibi ante omnis magna comitante caterva

Laocoon ardens summa decurrit ab arce (*Aen.* 2.40 f.)

Arte nova vocisque deum dulcedine captum

"Hoc mihi conloquium tecum" dixisse "manebit!" (*Meta.* 1.709 f.)

The position before the trihemimeral caesura is used much less frequently.

Cura tibi divum effigies et templa tueri;

bella viri pacemque gerent quis bella gerenda (*Aen.* 7.443 f.)

Ut templi tetigere gradus, procumbit uterque

pronus humi gelidoque pavens dedit oscula saxo (*Meta.* 1.375 f.)

The position before the bucolic diaeresis is used very seldom.

dum melior viris sanguis dabat, aemula necdum

temporibus geminis canebat sparsa senectus (*Aen.* 5.415 f.)

Me pia detinuit coniunx, pia mater Achillem,

primaque sunt illis data tempora, cetera vobis (*Meta.* 13.301 f.)

Very few rhyming words in either poem end in any positions other than these.

In both poems about as many instances of internal as consecutive rhyme appear and both kinds of rhyme often appear in a sequence of verses. Verses with rhyming words occur alone or at irregular intervals in mostly short sequences. 29 percent of the verses of the *Aeneid* contain rhyming words in the positions identified, and 34 percent of the verses of the *Metamorphoses*.

PERCENTAGE OF VERSES WITH RHYME

Book	<i>Aen.</i>	<i>Meta.</i>	Book	<i>Aen.</i>	<i>Meta.</i>
	%	%		%	%
1	34	37	8	30	33
2	32	35	9	23	31
3	30	38	10	28	31
4	26	33	11	31	34
5	27	32	12	25	31
6	29	36	13		34
7	29	33	14		34
			15		36

Considerable fluctuation is found in the number of verses with rhyme in the *Aeneid*, ranging from 34 percent of the verses in Book 1 to 23 percent in Book 9. The number of verses with rhyme also falls off markedly after the third book, and the longest interval in the poem without any of the rhyme identified lasts 25 verses (9.334-59). By comparison, Ovid has more rhyming verses proportionately than Vergil, and shows less fluctuation (38 percent in Book 3, 31 percent in Books 9, 10 and 12). Ovid's longest interval without any of the rhyme identified lasts only 20 verses (1.717-36, 14.279-98). These differences are significant. If rhyme were only a natural phenomenon in Roman poetry, we should expect it to show about the same overall character in these two long poems. Instead, the distribution of rhyming verses shows that Vergil used rhyme more sparingly and irregularly than Ovid.

Further differences between the two poets appear in a comparison of their heaviest concentrations of rhyming words. In both the *Aeneid* and the *Metamorphoses* these are often found where the subject matter appears to invite special ornament: for example, the fighting around

Priam's palace, in the *Aeneid* (2.438 ff.), and Medea's black magic, in the *Metamorphoses* (7.234 ff.). In such concentrations, however, Vergil is likely to rely on internal and/or consecutive rhyme before the penthemimeral caesura and at the end of the verse. In the description of the fighting at Priam's palace, frequent rhymes seem to intensify the relentless march of short, staccato clauses.

Haerent parietibus scalae positisque sub ipsos
nituntur gradibus clipeosque ad tela sinistris
proiecti obiciunt, prensant fastigia dextris.
Dardanidae contra turris ac tota domorum
culmina convellunt; his se, quando ultima cernunt,
extrema iam in morte parant defendere telis,
auratasque trabes, veterum decora alta parentum,
devolvunt; alii strictis mucronibus imas
obsedere fores, has servant agmine denso.
Instaurati animi regis succurrere tectis
auxilioquo levare viros vimque addere victis.

Limen erat caecaeque fores et pervius usus
tectorum inter se Priami, postesque relict
a tergo, infelix qua se, dum regna manebant,
saepius Andromache ferre incommitata solebat
ad soceros et avo puerum Astyanacta trahebat.
Evado ad summi fastigia culminis, unde
tela manu miseri iactabant inrita Teucris.
Turrim, in praecipiti stantem summisque sub astra
eductam tectis, unde omnis Troia videri
et Danaum solitae naves et Achaica castra,
adgressi ferre circum, qua summa labantis
iuncturas tabulata dabant, convellimus altis (*Aen.* 2.442-64)

The longest passage in the *Aeneid* of continuous rhyming verses is a tour de force in end rhyme. As the suspense of the contest of the bow rises to its climax, Vergil paces sense cola and verses so that they correspond—an effect unusual in the *Aeneid*. End rhyme intensifies this step-by-step quality of rising suspense.

ales, et ingenti sonuerunt omnia plausu.
Post acer Mnesthus adducto constitit arcu
alta petens, pariterque oculos telumque tetendit.
Ast ipsam miserandus avem contingere ferro
non valuit; nodos et vincula linea rupit

quis innexa pedem malo pendebat ab alto;
 illa Notos atque atra volans in nubila fugit.
 Tum rapidus, iamdudum arcu contenta parato
 tela tenens, fratrem Eurytion in vota vocavit,
 iam vacuo laetam caelo speculatus et alis
 plaudentem nigra figit sub nube columbam.
 Decidit exanimis vitamque reliquit in astris
 aetheriis fixamque refert delapsa sagittam.

Amissa solus palma superabat Aestes,
 qui tamen acrias telum contorsit in auras (*Aen.* 5.506-20)

These concentrations of rhyming verses are comparatively plentiful in the first part of the *Aeneid*, but are rarer after the third book. They include the prophecy of Jupiter to Venus (*Aen.* 1. 266-97), the murals depicting the Trojan War in Dido's temple (*Aen.* 1.465-92), a portion of Sinon's tale (*Aen.* 2.97-120), the conclusion of Sinon's tale (*Aen.* 2.174-93), Aeneas' description of the horse faltering at the threshold of Troy, and of Cassandra's prophecies ignored (*Aen.* 2.241-51), the embarkation for Crete (*Aen.* 3.120-31), the beginning of Achaemenides' tale (*Aen.* 3.612-30), sites passed by the Trojans at sea (*Aen.* 3.693-706), part of Evander's tour (*Aen.* 8.344-55), the cave of the Cyclopes (*Aen.* 8.423-33), the shield of Aeneas (*Aen.* 8.635-63), the judgment of Jupiter (*Aen.* 10.106-16), the burial of the Latin dead (*Aen.* 11.202-10), the infant Camilla and Metabus crossing the river (*Aen.* 11.564-76), the death of Arruns and the flight of the Latin allies (*Aen.* 11.850-74). Fifty-seven passages contain five or more verses continuously rhymed.¹²

Ovid, on the other hand, in his concentrations of rhyming verses, makes greater use of rhyming words in a variety of the verse positions identified. Frequent rhymes help make the sorcery of Medea incantatory.

(Aesonem proferri Medea)

iussit et in plenos resolutum carmine somnos
 exanimi similem stratis porrexit in herbis.

Hinc procul Aesoniden, procul hinc iubet ire ministros

¹² 1.109-14, 287-97, 317-22, 390-95, 478-83, 523-29, 740-45; 2.5-10, 110-14, 177-83, 241-47, 448-51, 456-64, 552-58; 3.363-67, 612-17, 682-86; 4.198-202, 243-47, 426-30, 655-59; 5.98-102, 146-50, 319-23, 382-86, 506-20; 6.58-62, 347-52, 503-508, 682-88, 718-22, 802-809; 7.94-98, 138-42, 312-18, 378-82, 509-14, 561-65, 692-96; 8.540-44, 556-60, 669-74, 703-708; 9.234-38, 248-54, 476-80; 10.64-68, 496-502; 11.301-305, 334-38, 572-76, 850-60, 885-90; 12.209-15, 279-83, 412-16, 561-65.

et monet arcanis oculos remove profanos.
 Diffugiunt iussi; passis Medea capillis
 bacchantum ritu flagrantia circuit aras
 multifidasque faces in fessa sanguinis atra
 tingit et infectas geminis accendit in aris
 terque senem flamma, ter aqua, ter sulphure lustrat.
 Interea validum posito medicamen aeno
 fervet et exsultat spumisque tumentibus albet.
 Illic Haemonia radices valle resectas
 seminaque floresque et sucos incoquit atros.
 Adicit extremo lapides oriente petitos
 et quas Oceani refluxum mare lavit harenas;
 addit et exceptas luna pernocte pruinas
 et strigis infamis ipsis cum carnibus alas
 inque virum soliti vultus mutare ferinos
 ambigui prosecta lupi; nec defuit illis
 squamea Cinyphii tenuis membrana chelydri
 vivacisque iecur cervi; quibus insuper addit
 ora caputque novem cornicis saecula passae.
 His et mille aliis postquam sine nomine rebus
 propositum instruxit mortali barbara maius
 arenti ramo iampridem mitis olivae
 omnia confudit cummisque inmiscuit ima.
 Ecce vetus calido versatus stipes aeno
 fit viridis primo nec longo tempore frondes
 induit et subito gravidis oneratur olivis;
 at quacumque cavis spumas eiecit aenis
 ignis et in terram guttae cecidere calentes (*Meta.* 7.253-83)

Ovid, too, however, can concentrate on end-rhyme if he wishes. The exaggeration and monotony of the rhyme in the following passage (including rhymes in positions other than those identified in the present study) create jingles of such inanity that they may well have been intended by the poet to heighten the grotesque effect of Cyclops in love.¹³

Acidis in gremio residens procul auribus hausit
 talia dicta meis auditaque verba notavi:
 "Candidior folio nivei, Galatea, ligustri
 floridior pratis, longe procerior alno,

¹³ The special contribution of rhyme to parody and absurdity will form part of a future study.

splendidior vitro, ternero lascivior haedo,
 levior adsiduo detritis aequore conchis,
 solibus hibernis, aestiva gratior umbra,
 nobilior pomis, platano conspectior alta,
 lucidior glacie, matura dulcior uva,
 mollior et cygni plumis et lacte coacto
 et, si non fugias, riguo formosior horto:
 saevior indomitis eadem Galatea iuvencis,
 durior annosa quercu, fallacior undis,
 lentior et salicis virgis et vitibus albis,
 his immobilior scopulis, violentior amne

(*Meta.* 13.787-801)

Other concentrations of rhyming verses in the *Metamorphoses* include the instructions of Phoebus to Phaethon (*Meta.* 2.133-44), the epiphany of Bacchus (*Meta.* 3.665-74), Cephalus' recollections of his wife (*Meta.* 7.730-40), the speech of Hercules in agony (*Meta.* 9.185-96), the palace of Somnus (*Meta.* 11.609-20), portions of the debate for the arms of Achilles (*Meta.* 13.296-306, 368-77)—the first 380 verses of Book 13 are particularly rich in rhyme—the catalogue of the disguises of Vertumnus (*Meta.* 14.644-55), and Venus' speech after foreseeing the death of Caesar (*Meta.* 15.762-75). Such longer concentrations of rhyme as these are found twice as often in the *Aeneid* as they are in the *Metamorphoses*. Ovid, however, with only three more books than Vergil, has nearly twice as many passages of five or more verses continuously rhymed: 105 such passages compared to Vergil's fifty-seven.¹⁴

Concentrations of verses with consecutive rhyme are especially interesting since in these concentrations patterns of rhyme or "rhyme-schemes" (as we know them in our own poetry) can sometimes be

¹⁴ 1.88-93, 295-300, 355-60, 479-83; 2.133-44, 456-61, 474-79, 550-54, 817-22; 3.84-90, 175-82, 184-90, 217-22, 324-28, 362-66, 580-84, 665-74, 724-30; 4.184-89, 210-14, 316-23, 580-85, 706-10; 5.112-16, 338-43, 469-73, 569-74, 621-25; 6.105-109, 166-70, 324-28, 405-409, 419-23, 427-31, 531-38, 688-93; 7.13-18, 138-45, 190-94, 200-206, 253-57, 265-69, 275-82, 703-707, 730-40; 8.166-71, 226-31, 287-91, 303-307, 335-39, 558-62, 642-51, 672-76, 863-69; 9.22-26, 207-12, 505-509, 542-46, 586-90, 682-87; 10.98-102, 176-80, 346-50, 555-59; 11.113-17, 132-37, 217-21, 235-42, 303-307, 339-44, 403-407, 433-39, 574-78, 609-20, 750-55; 12.1-5, 145-49, 480-84, 620-24; 13.75-79, 117-22, 296-306, 368-77, 465-70, 692-97, 734-38, 787-801, 865-71, 923-27; 14.8-14, 270-74, 534-39, 644-55, 755-60; 15.90-95, 104-108, 281-85, 343-47, 358-62, 369-73, 525-32, 730-35, 762-75, 784-88, 812-17. Cf. p. 57 n. 12.

seen. In both the *Aeneid* and the *Metamorphoses* consecutive rhyme is usually confined to two verses, but three and four verses are often found. Apart from couplets, the sequence *aaa* is the commonest pattern of consecutive rhyme found in both poems.

ter frustra compressa manus effugit imago,
par levibus ventis volucrique simillima somno.
Sic demum socios consumpta nocte reviso (*Aen.* 2.793-95)

In a four-verse sequence, both poets prefer the sequence *aabb*.

antiqui proles bello praeclara Dolonis,
nomine avum referens, animo manibusque parentem,
qui quondam, castra ut Danaum speculator adiret,
ausus Pelidae pretium sibi poscere currus (*Aen.* 12.347-50)

Both use the sequence *abab* less often than *aabb*.

nigram Hiemi pecudem, Zephyris felicibus albam.
Fama volat pulsum regnis cessisse paternis
Idomenea ducem, desertaque litora Cretae,
hoste vacare domum sedesque astare relictas. (*Aen.* 3.120-23)

The sequence *abba* rarely appears in either poem.

Talibus accensi firmatur et agmine denso
consistunt. Turnus paulatim excedere pugna
et fluvium petere ac partem quae cingitur unda.
Acrius hoc Teucri clamore incumbere magno
(*Aen.* 9.788-91)

The sequence *aaaa* is very rare.¹⁵

¹⁵ Sequences of five or more verses continuously rhymed frequently contain within them the sequences *aaa*, *aabb*, *abab*, *abba* and *aaaa*; see n. 12 and 14 above. The remaining instances of these three- and four-verse sequences in the *Aeneid* are 1.247-49, 517-19, 610-12, 655-57, 748-50; 2.235-37, 249-51, 793-95; 3.27-29, 622-24; 4.18-20, 289-91, 386-88; 5.446-48, 648-50; 6.830-32; 7.577-79, 795-97; 8.344-46, 522-24; 9.644-46, 681-83; 10.6-8, 405-407, 747-49; 11.104-106, 173-75, 344-46; 12.236-38, 352-54, 539-41 (*aaa*); 1.276-79, 480-83; 2.73-75, 77, 768-71; 4.331-34, 374-77; 5.662-65, 852-55; 6.217-20; 7.780-83; 8.55-58; 10.110-13, 367-70; 11.24-27, 125-28; 12.347-50, 635-38 (*aabb*); 1.331-34; 2.103-106, 320-23, 378-81; 3.120-23; 6.597-600; 9.805-808 (*abab*); 7.422-25; 8.655-58; 9.788-91; 10.110-13; 11.660-63 (*abba*); 3.698-701; 11.462-65, 531-34 (*aaaa*). In the *Metamorphoses* the instances are 1.10-12, 118-20, 144-46, 315-17, 336-38; 2.33-35, 114-16, 259-61, 428-30, 440-42, 528-30, 745-47; 3.204-206, 271-73, 628-30; 4.336-38, 592-94, 748-50; 5.378-80; 6.42-44, 134-36, 180-82, 371-73, 557-59; 7.126-28, 313-15; 8.119-21; 9.57-59; 10.92-94, 197-99, 365-67; 11.358-60, 702-704; 12.387-89; 13.248-50, 565-67, 621-23; 14.586-88, 781-83, 833-35; 15.428-30

arripuitque locum et silvis insedit iniquis.
 Velocem interea superis in sedibus Opim,
 unam ex virginibus sociis sacraque caterva,
 compellabat et has tristes Latonia voces (*Aen.* 11.531-34)

Ovid differs from Vergil in that all four-verse sequences in the *Metamorphoses* contain rhyming words placed either before the penthemimeral caesura or at the end of the verse. In the *Aeneid* Vergil has four-verse sequences with rhyming words placed before the hephthemimeral caesura at 2.73-75, 7; 11.531-34; 12.347-50.

The *Aeneid* and the *Metamorphoses* contain a large number of sequences of five or more verses continuously rhymed (see pp. 57, 59 above). These sequences occur at random throughout both poems. Most are composed of couplets and/or triplets or four-verse sequences in groups of five or six verses. Intentional symmetry may be intended at *Aen.* 1.109-14, 8.703-708 (*aabbcc*), 1.290-97 (*aababacc*), 1.317-22 (*aabbaa*), 1.525-29 (*ababa*), 2.5-10, 459-64 (*ababcc*), 2.552-58 (*ababacc*), and 5.506-18 (*aabcbcbdede*); likewise at *Meta.* 11.132-37 (*abcabc*), 11.235-41 (*aabbbcc*), 13.368-77 (*abacbccdd*), 13.793-800 (*aaabbbccc*) and 15.104-108 (*aaaaa*).

We have seen that both poets may employ rhyming words in concentrations for various purposes, to intensify the staccato effect of short, parallel clauses, to render a passage incantatory, or even monotonous by an exaggerated use of jingles. Evidence of intentional symmetrical "rhyme-schemes" is perhaps to be found in occasional sequences of consecutively rhyming verses. Other possibly deliberate uses of rhyme might be identified, including the heavily rhymed proverbial maxims with which Ovid closes the speech of the Pythagorean (*Meta.* 15.474-76); we have noted that old charms and saws were traditionally rhymed.¹⁶ Perhaps Vergil and Ovid display what

(*aaa*); 1.129-32, 175-78, 465-68, 692-95; 2.510-13; 3.66-69, 259-62; 4.431-34; 5.174-77; 8.13-16, 439-42; 9.193-96, 218-21, 595-98; 10.369-72, 689-92; 11.286-89; 12.158-61; 13.552-55; 14.447-50, 575-78; 15.807-10 (*aabb*); 1.105-108; 2.107-10, 775-78; 5.664-67; 6.150-53, 233-36; 7.717-20; 8.187-90, 381-84; 13.86-89; 14.265-68; 15.224-27 (*abab*); 8.28-31; 14.812-15; 15.446-49 (*abba*); 2.805-808; 15.595-98 (*aaaa*).

¹⁶ Cf. E. Diehl, *Poetarum Romanorum Veterum Reliquiae* (Bonn 1911) 8:

hiberno pulvere verno
 luto grandia farra,
 Camille, metes

R. G. Austin (comparing *Aen.* 4.189 f., 256 f., 331 f.) calls the Romans' "natural taste for 'jingles.'" Ovid's rhymes have also been described as serving to speed up the movement of his already rapid dactylic lines by dividing them into short acoustic units.¹⁷ The marking of these units by rhyming words would aid in rapid reading aloud. As we have seen, most rhyming final syllables in the *Metamorphoses* fall before the major caesurae and at the ends of verses; thus, they mark the cola in the lines in which they are found. Ovid does not compose complex sentences in his poetry; his phrases and clauses are frequently coterminous with cola. Rhyme participates with sense units and metrical rhythm to provide brief, intelligible and well-marked units for the oral reader.

Every claim, however, or theory of intentional rhyme in Latin poetry must answer a major objection: that, in an inflected language syntactical relationships among words make rhyme merely inevitable. Actually, nearly half the instances of rhyme in the *Aeneid* and the *Metamorphoses* involve words that are *not* syntactically related. Let us consider this question in greater detail.

Studies in elegiac verse have long since shown that internally rhyming words placed before the main caesura in the third foot and at the end of the verse are usually related syntactically; in fact, that these words usually consist of a noun and its attribute.¹⁸ In both the *Aeneid* and the *Metamorphoses* most internally rhyming words are related, and indeed, most of such words that are related consist of an attribute and a noun—in that order. In his study of word-order in epic verse, Carl Conrad showed at length that attribute-and-noun had since Homer been placed at major caesurae in the hexameter verse to mark sense pauses and frame rhetorical cola.¹⁹ Conrad found that, after attribute-noun, the next commonest pair to occupy these positions consisted of noun-attribute; in the *Aeneid* and the *Metamorphoses* noun-attribute is the next commonest relationship found between internally rhyming words.

Conrad's disclosures would seem to reduce internal rhyme, at least

¹⁷ Brooks Otis, *Ovid as an Epic Poet* 2nd ed. (Cambridge 1970) 76.

¹⁸ For discussion and bibliography, see Wilkinson (above, note 6) 32-34.

¹⁹ Carl Conrad, "Traditional patterns of word order in Latin epic from Ennius to Vergil," *HSCP* 69 (1965) 195-258.

in these two poems, to the status of by-product. He went on, however, to cite as the next commonest pairs of related words genitive-noun, noun-genitive, participle-noun and noun-participle. Internally rhyming words in the hexameters of Vergil and Ovid rarely show these relationships. After attribute-noun and noun-attribute, the commonest relationship between internally rhyming words in both poems is that of parallel verbs.

observans quae signa ferant, quo tendere pergant. (*Aen.* 6.198)

Pone metus! Veniam simulacraque nostra relinquam. (*Meta.* 15.658)

Besides parallel verbs several syntactical relationships are represented by internally rhyming words, but very infrequently in both poems. Those appearing more than ten times include, in the *Aeneid*, parallel participles (cf. 3.630), parallel genitives (cf. 1.87), parallel adjectives (cf. 8.72), parallel subjects (cf. 10.253); in the *Metamorphoses*, parallel subjects (cf. 1.559), parallel adjectives (cf. 6.300), parallel direct objects (cf. 13.814), parallel participles (cf. 4.361).²⁰

In the *Aeneid* slightly more, and in the *Metamorphoses* slightly less, than 20 percent of all internally rhyming words are not related in any way. Vergil and Ovid have clearly gone beyond the device identified by Conrad. As his observations indicate, they have placed attribute-noun and noun-attribute pairs before verse-breaks in many verses; but I submit that they have also filled the same positions in other verses with pairs of words unrelated syntactically.²¹ Syntactical relationships may explain some, but by no means all, the internal rhyme in the *Aeneid* and the *Metamorphoses*.

Words in consecutive rhyme, moreover, are rarely related in any way. Wherever they appear, these words commonly end in a similar inflection, but are syntactically unrelated.

²⁰ In both poems, as has been noted, attribute-noun constitutes the relationship most often found when rhyming words are related. Ovid, however, is even more likely than Vergil to rhyme on words in this relationship. Vergil rhymes noticeably more often than Ovid on noun-attribute, parallel verbs, and words in other types of relationships. The difference between the two poets probably reflects Ovid's greater willingness to locate an attribute and its noun in one verse in that order; the pattern is found very frequently in his, and others', elegiac verse.

²¹ Syntactically related words need not of course necessarily rhyme; both poets may have placed many (non-rhyming) related words at verse breaks which this study would not disclose.

Nec minor in castris luctus Rhamnete reperto
exsanguis et primis una tot caecae peremptis (*Aen.* 9.452 f.)

The next largest number of these words is not only unrelated but also ends in completely dissimilar inflections.

per cognata suis exempla furoribus Ino?
Est via declivis funesta nubila taxo: (*Meta.* 4.431 f.)

Syntactically related words are the least common type in consecutive rhyme.

Accingunt omnes operi pedibusque rotarum
subiciunt lapsus, et stuppea vincula collo
intendunt; scandit fatalis machina muros (*Aen.* 2.235-37)

It is impossible to account for even a majority of the words in consecutive rhyme by citing syntactical relationship in an inflected language. A number of the noun and verb endings employed by Latin serve to represent entirely different meanings: a Latin poet may thus easily rhyme words unrelated syntactically, and in consecutive rhyme we find it done in nearly all cases. The majority of words in internal rhyme are syntactically related. Even among these, however, one pair of rhyming words in every five is not related. We must accept that, in the *Aeneid* and the *Metamorphoses*, nearly half the rhyming words in positions before verse-breaks (taking internal and consecutive rhyme together) show no syntactical relationship; and so cannot be a by-product of that relationship in an inflected language.

Nearly all the rhyme in both poems, moreover, is found in association with a feature which demonstrates conclusively that it is deliberate and not the result of coincidence. Some 90 percent of the verses with internal or consecutive rhyme in the *Aeneid* and the *Metamorphoses*, alone or in sequences, are associated with major sense pauses throughout both poems. By major sense pauses I mean periods, colons, semicolons and question and exclamation marks; and I refer to pauses so punctuated by at least two of three editors of each poem.²² Rhyming verses in

²² The Mediceus ms. of Vergil (fifth century) was punctuated by Asterius Apronianus, consul in 494. In the first century B.C., however, punctuation was either non-existent or minimal (see F. G. Kenyon, *Books and Readers in Ancient Greece and Rome*, Oxford 1951), and the definition of a sense pause in an ancient author's work is—up to a point—a matter of subjective decision by his editor. I have accepted major sense pauses when they are punctuated in at least two of the editions of Nettleship (Oxford 1884), Sabbadini (Rome 1930), Mynors (Oxford 1969); and Magnus (Berlin 1914), Bosselaar-Proosdij (Leiden 1959) and Haupt-Ehwald-von Albrecht (Zurich 1966).

association with major sense pauses can be illustrated as follows.

Internal rhyme may follow a major sense pause.

incipiam. *Fracti bello fatisque repulsi* (*Aen.* 2.13)

incubuit ferro deceptoque decipit omnes.

Rursus harenosae fugiens nova moenia terrae (*Meta.* 14.81 f.)

Consecutive rhyme may follow a major sense pause.

*Continuo auditae voces vagitus et ingens
infantumque animae flentes, in limine primo* (*Aen.* 6.426 f.)

*Illa nihil; tacito tantummodo victa pudore
insidiosa malo cum coniuge limina fugit* (*Meta.* 7.743 f.)

Internal rhyme may precede a major sense pause.

non Teucros agat in Rutulos; Teucrum arma quiescant (*Aen.* 12.78)

et petere e vivis libandas fontibus undas. (*Meta.* 3.26)

Consecutive rhyme may precede a major sense pause.

*et solida imponit taurorum viscera flammis,
pingue super oleum fundens ardentibus extis.* (*Aen.* 6.253 f.)

*gurgite caerulo Septem prohibete triones
sideraque in caelo, stupri mercede, recepta
pellite, ne puro tingatur in aequore paelex!* (*Meta.* 2.528-30)

Internal rhyme may both precede and follow a major sense pause.

Sic ait et dextra crinem secat: omnis et una (*Aen.* 4.704)

non profecturas tenebat ad aethera palmas:

Dardanidas matres patriorum signa deorum (*Meta.* 13.411 f.)

Consecutive rhyme may both precede and follow a major sense pause.

*Quae vobis, quae digna, viri, pro laudibus istis
praemia posse rear solvi? Pulcherrima primum
di moresque dabunt vestri: tum cetera reddet* (*Aen.* 9.252-54)

per cognata suis exempla furoribus Ino?

Est via declivis funesta nubila taxo: (*Meta.* 4.431 f.)

92 percent of the verses with rhyme in the *Aeneid* are associated in these ways with major sense pauses, and 88 percent of the verses with rhyme in the *Metamorphoses*.

Vergil, with 5 percent fewer rhyming verses than Ovid, associates those verses with major sense pauses slightly more often than Ovid does. In both poets most internal rhyme associated with sense pauses either precedes or follows a sense pause. It is not as common for internal rhyme both to precede *and* follow a sense pause. Consecutive rhyme, by comparison, typically precedes *and* follows a sense pause. In Vergil this tendency of consecutive rhyme is even more pronounced than in Ovid. It is less common in both poets for consecutive rhyme simply to precede a sense pause, or simply to follow one.²³

²³ Only a thorough study of the rest of the Latin poets can provide a comprehensive picture of the uses made of this kind of rhyme. The following percentages are based on selected samples, and are only suggestive of the incidence to be found in the poets listed of the kind of rhyme discussed in the present study. The samples are listed in increasing order according to the percentage of their verses which display rhyme.

	Number of verses	Percentage of verses with rhyme	Percentage of verses with rhyme associated with sense pauses
		%	%
Horace <i>Serm.</i> 2.1	86	21	78
Ennius fr. with five vv. or more	87	22	95
Persius 1	134	24	84
Catullus 62	66	26	100
Lucilius fr. with five vv. or more	60	27	75
Lucretius 1.1-264	264	28	85
Horace <i>Serm.</i> 1.1	121	29	97
Grattius <i>Cynegeticon</i> 1-262	262	29	87
Culex	414	30	75
Lucan <i>Bell. Civ.</i> 1.1-271	271	33	86
Horace <i>Ep.</i> 2.1	270	34	82
Juvenal 1	171	36	87
Horace <i>Ep.</i> 1.1	108	37	90
Manilius 1.1-254	254	38	74
Cicero <i>De consulatu</i> <i>meo</i> (fr.)	78	40	80

A demonstration that rhyme can be used intentionally at certain points and on a large scale in Latin poetry may be of occasional help in establishing a text where it is uncertain. The part played in sound repetition by a particular reading may, other things being equal, increase the likelihood that it is correct. For example, *Aen.* 8.46 (*hic locus urbis erit requies ea certa laborum*) is omitted by M, P and other witnesses, although it is found in R. Mynors brackets the verse:

45 alba, solo recubans, albi circum ubera nati.

47 Ex quo ter denis urbem redeuntibus annis

V. 47 now follows a major sense pause immediately, an appropriate position in which to

PERCENTAGE OF VERSES WITH RHYME
ASSOCIATED WITH MAJOR SENSE PAUSES

Book	<i>Aen.</i>	<i>Meta.</i>	Book	<i>Aen.</i>	<i>Meta.</i>
	%	%		%	%
1	98	88	8	89	88
2	92	87	9	93	88
3	91	91	10	86	89
4	91	85	11	93	87
5	92	92	12	91	90
6	94	86	13		91
7	89	84	14		87
			15		84

In the following tables, the numbers of verses in the *Aeneid* and the *Metamorphoses* with internal and consecutive rhyme are shown according to categories in which they have been investigated in this study. The tables of numbers of verses rhyming internally are divided horizontally into the four combinations of verse positions in which most pairs of rhyming words stand: (1) before the penthemimeral caesura and the end of the verse; (2) before the hephthemimeral caesura and the end of the verse; (3) before the bucolic diaeresis and the end of the verse; (4) before the trihemimeral and hephthemimeral caesurae. These tables are also divided vertically into four columns,

find a verse with strong internal rhyme. V. 46 itself is without rhyme. Again, at *Aen.* 9.683 f. Mynors prints a colon between verses.

Inrumpunt aditus Rutuli ut videre patentis:
continuo Quercens et pulcher Aquiculus armis

Ribbeck had preferred to omit this punctuation, but end rhyme is most often found preceding and following a major sense pause. It would be interesting to discover how often an alternative reading with substantial support is also the reading which produces rhyme at crucial points. At *Aen.* 4.436, for example M has *cumulata* and P *cumulatam*:

quam mihi cum dederit *cumulatam* morte remittam.

Servius knows *cumulata*, but he reports that *cumulatam* was the reading approved by Tucca and Varius.

The discovery of pervasive and intentional use of sound repetition in Vergil and Ovid should certainly encourage a realistic effort by scholars and students to read Latin poetry aloud. It is sometimes said that all reading in antiquity was reading aloud. B. M. W. Knox, "Silent reading in antiquity," *GRBS* 9 (1968) 421-35, shows that this is an exaggeration. There seems to be no doubt, however, that poetry was meant to be recited. Objective evidence of Vergil's and Ovid's extensive use of rhyme should help to underline the fact that silent reading of their poetry is akin to silent reading of musical scores. Music may be imagined, but it is written to be heard.

AENEID: VERSES RHYMING INTERNALLY

	Following Sense Pause				Preceding Sense Pause				Both				Neither				
	T				T				T				T				
	atn	nat	pv	other U	atn	nat	pv	other U	atn	nat	pv	other U	atn	nat	pv	other U	
Penth. Bk. and Verse-end	1	3	2	3	8	13	2	6	1	3	25	1	2	3	1	2	1
	2	10		1	13	13		4		1	18	5		6		1	6
	3	16		2	21	11	1	3			16		1	4		2	7
	4	7	1	1	2	5	2	5	2	2	16	1		1	4	1	7
	5	12	8	1	6	14	2	2	2	3	23	2	1	6	4	4	4
	6	7	3	3	2	1	11	5	2	3	25	2	3	8	1		5
	7	12	3	3	1	5	24	13	3	4	25	2	1	5	7	2	14
	8	11	2	1	2	17	11	4	4	3	25	3	3	5	3	1	6
	9	9	2	2	3	3	19	9		1	11	1	2	1			2
	10	6	4	2	3	1	16	13	1	3	18	4	1	5	1	1	6
	11	9	5		3	2	19	16	3	3	26	2		5	4	1	8
	12	15	1	2	3	1	22	5		2	8	2	2	8	6	1	9
	117	31	18	19	29	214	134	23	38	16	21	25	5	10	40	8	75
Hephth. Bk. and Verse-end	1	9	1	1	2	1	14			2	10	2		3	1		1
	2	7	1	2	2	2	5	2	2		10	2	2	6	3	2	5
	3	14	1	1	3	19	5	7		1	13	2	2	7	4	1	6
	4	8		2	1	12	6	2	1	1	10	2	1	4		1	3
	5	5	3	1	2	2	3	6	2	1	14	1		2	3	1	6
	6	6	1			8	11	5	2		19	2	1	4	1		4
	7	6	3	1	2	12	11	4	2		17	1	2	4	3	1	4
	8	5	6	2	2	1	7	4		1	14	1		4	3	1	4
	9	5	2	1	1	9	2	2			5			0	2		2
	10	7	9	2	1	5	11	5	1	1	18	5	2	1	3	3	8
	11	7	5	1	5	18	12	6			18	2		2	2	1	3
	12	5	5	1	2	13	6	3	1	1	11	2	1	3	3		3
	84	37	9	15	25	170	86	48	9	6	10	20	9	6	25	7	47

B. Diac. and Verse-end	Bk.	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17	18	19	20	21	22	23	24	25	26	27	28	29	30
		3	2	1	1	1	1	8	2	2	1	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3
		3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3
		4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
		5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
		6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6
		7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7
		8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8
		9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9
		10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10
		11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11
		12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12
		35	9	1	5	10		60	31	2	0	3	4	40	7	2	0	0	0	9	10	0	0	1	1	12					
Trih. and Hephth.	Bk.	1	2	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3
		4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
		5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
		6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	6
		7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7	7
		8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8
		9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9	9
		10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10
		11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11
		12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	12
		32	7	2	1	11		53	31	5	12	7	13	68	4	2	0	0	8	14	22	0	2	3	3	30					

METAMORPHOSES: VERSES RHYMING INTERNALLY

	Following Sense Pause				Preceding Sense Pause				Both				Neither			
	T				T				T				T			
	atm	nat	pv	other	U	atm	nat	pv	other	U	atm	nat	pv	other	U	T
Penth. Bk.	1	10	5	3	5	23	20	5	4	1	6	36	1	9	2	17
and	2	17	1	1	3	1	22	4	3	2		31	1	3	1	6
Verse-end	3	18	2	3	2	5	12	3	3	1	4	23	4	4	1	10
	4	5	3	2	3	6	19	1	4	2	4	29		12	2	20
	5	15	5	2	2	24	21	1	6	2	2	30	1	5	1	7
	6	8	1	2	2	15	22	3	2	1	2	30	2	10	1	14
	7	16	4	5	2	7	34	26	2	3	1	35		8	1	12
	8	14	2	1	4	4	25	1	6	2	2	31		9	1	11
	9	16	4	1	7	28	17	1	3	4	2	27	1	7	3	15
	10	12	2	1	4	19	21	2	1	3	3	30		1	2	8
	11	13	1	3	8	25	14	3	3	2	1	23	2	11	4	19
	12	11	1	2	14	24	1	1	1	1	1	28		4	1	6
	13	17	3	4	3	6	33	24	3	9	3	47	1	8	2	14
	14	14	2	1	7	24	23	3	1	1	1	28	1	15	5	24
	15	21	1	1	2	25	32	1	2	1	1	37	1	12	1	17
	207	36	19	31	68	361	317	39	47	24	38	465	14	118	19	200
Hephth. Bk.	1	13	6	3	1	23	11	2			2	15	1	5	1	7
and	2	16	1	2	1	21	16	3	1	2		22	1	9	1	12
Verse-end	3	12	3	1	1	17	8	6			1	15	2	3	1	3
	4	14	5	2	2	23	11	5		1	2	18		4	1	6
	5	8	2			11	10	4				14	2	1	1	7
	6	14	5		2	21	12	3		1		16	2	5	2	7
	7	11	2	1	2	14	11	4		1	1	17	8	8	2	11
	8	12	4	2	3	21	23	4		2	1	29		3	1	4
	9	13	3		3	19	12	5	3	1	1	21		4	1	5
	10	6	2		1	9	6	3	1	1	1	12		3	1	4
	11	10	4	1	4	19	13	1		1	2	17	1	2	6	8
	12	9	4		1	15	10		1		2	13		0	2	5
	13	11	4	1	4	20	7	6		1	1	15	2	2	1	9
	14	10	2	1	2	16	15		1		1	17	2	6	4	6
	15	13	5	1	2	21	10	1			2	15	1	11	1	12
	172	52	6	13	27	270	175	47	7	12	15	256	20	79	12	106
									1	4	9	39		1	8	

AENEID: VERSES RHYMING CONSECUTIVELY

	Following Sense Pause				Preceding Sense Pause				Both				Neither			
	Same infl.	Same infl.	Diff. infl.	T	Same infl.	Same infl.	Diff. infl.	T	Same infl.	Same infl.	Diff. infl.	T	Same infl.	Same infl.	Diff. infl.	T
Unre.	Re.	Re.	infl.		Unre.	Re.	infl.		Unre.	Re.	infl.		Unre.	Re.	infl.	
Verse-end																
Bk.	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12				
	14	4	8	26	14	4	8	14	39	12	29	80	4			0
	2	2	2	4	4	2	8	14	43	6	38	87				4
	4	2	6	12	2	2	2	6	14	2	19	35	2	2		4
	2	4	4	6	2	2	2	2	24	10	21	55			2	2
	10	2	7	19	2	2	2	6	25	2	21	48	2			2
	14	2	4	20	10	2	2	12	35	2	11	48	4	2		6
	10	6	2	18	4	2	2	8	16	2	25	41	4	2		6
	2	10	2	14	2	2	2	4	18	4	20	42	10			10
	8	4	4	12				0	24	2	16	42	2	4		6
	4	5	4	13		2	2	2	22	8	20	50	2	6		8
	8	6	6	14	4	2	8	14	42	2	14	58	6			6
	4	12	2	16	2	4	2	8	44	4	16	64				0
	82	31	61	174	36	16	38	90	346	54	250	650	36	2	16	54
Penth. Caes. Bk.																
	4	4	8	16	6	2	2	10	29	4	7	40	2			2
	4	2	6	12	2	2		2	10	4	14	28	2			2
	4	4		4		4	4	4	25	2	8	35	2			2
	2	4	2	4	4	2	2	8	4	2	17	23			2	2
	4	4	2	10	2	2	2	4	10	6	8	24	2	2		6
	2	6	2	10	10	2		10	16		14	30		2		2
	2	6	6	8	6	2		8	18		15	33				0
			0		2		2	4	28	2	10	40	2			2
	6		4	10				0	19	2	10	31			2	2
			6	6	2		2	4	14		14	28	2	2		6
	4	4	2	10	4		2	6	27	4	16	47	2			2
		2	2	2	2			2	17		11	28	2		2	4
	28	24	40	92	36	10	16	62	217	26	144	387	16	6	10	32

	Following Sense Pause			Preceding Sense Pause			Both			Neither		
	Same infl. Unre.	Same infl. Re.	Diff. infl.	Same infl. Unre.	Same infl. Re.	Diff. infl.	Same infl. Unre.	Same infl. Re.	Diff. infl.	Same infl. Unre.	Same infl. Re.	Diff. infl.
Verse-end Bk.	12	4	16	21	2	8	31	6	20	49	2	2
1	4	12	18	14	10	4	28	9	16	45	4	6
2	6	2	16	6	6	4	16	12	19	41	2	10
3	12	8	12	10	8		18	6	16	22	2	8
4	6	2	12	4	10		14	18	5	29	4	4
5	10	9	19	8	6		14	20	2	41	4	9
6	8	6	18	8		2	10	18	5	36	2	10
7	4	2	10	6	4	6	16	28	6	48	4	17
8	8	4	14	4	4	6	10	10	8	40	2	2
9	8	4	22	2	4	4	10	16	2	38	2	2
10	8	2	12	8	6		14	31	8	51	2	2
11	2	6	10	8	8	2	10	12	14	26	4	6
12	11	2	17	8	2		10	26	14	88	4	10
13	2	10	12	8	2		10	24	2	41	9	0
14	17	6	32	10	4	2	14	18	4	49	2	11
15	12	4	26	4	4		10	18	27			
	124	32	98	113	74	38	225	282	81	281	45	99
Penth. Caes. Bk.	10	4	7	14	4	4	18	13	4	14	4	6
1	4	6	10	14	2	2	20	13	4	11	4	8
2	4	2	12	2	6		8	20	14	16	2	2
3	2	6	8	10	8	9	27	17	4	9	2	2
4	4	2	8	6	4	4	14	6	2	17	0	0
5	4	2	4	4	8	2	14	15	4	14	4	10
6	2	6	10	4	4	4	8	18	4	15	5	10
7	8	2	8	10	6	6	22	24	4	19	4	6
8	2		2	4			0	12	6	19	2	6
9	6	4	10	10	6	2	18	16	9	9	2	7
10	4	4	8	4	2	2	8	19	2	41	2	2
11	4	2	2	4	4	4	12	18	2	28	2	2
12	4	4	15	4	4	2	6	16	4	14	2	0
13	8	8	22	7	8		15	14	4	12	2	2
14	16	4	24	4	2	2	6	20	2	24	4	4
15	74	38	52	97	56	43	196	241	60	221	30	67

[illegible]

representing (1) internal rhyme following a major sense pause; (2) preceding a major sense pause; (3) both preceding *and* following a major sense pause; and (4) internal rhyme in no way associated with major sense pauses. These four columns are further subdivided according to the syntactical relationship of the rhyming words: attribute-noun pairs (atn), noun-attribute pairs (nat), parallel verbs (pv), other relationships (other), and rhyming words unrelated syntactically (U). Columns of totals (T) are provided, and separate figures for each book of both poems are given in every case.

The tables of numbers of verses rhyming consecutively are divided horizontally into the five verse positions in which most rhyming words stand: (1) the end of the verse; (2) before the penthemimeral caesura; (3) before the hephthemimeral caesura; (4) before the trihemimeral caesura; and (5) before the bucolic diaeresis. These tables are also divided vertically into four columns, representing (1) consecutive rhyme following a major sense pause; (2) preceding a major sense pause; (3) both preceding *and* following a major sense pause; and (4) consecutive rhyme in no way associated with major sense pauses. These four columns are further subdivided according to the relationship between the rhyming words: the same inflection, but unrelated (Same infl Unre), different inflections altogether (Diff infl), and the same inflection shared by related words (Same infl Re). Columns of totals (T) are provided, and separate figures for each book of both poems are given in every case.

Discussing punctuation ("id est, qui dicit, et incipiat ubi oportet et desinat"), Quintilian reviews the opening verses of the *Aeneid* one by one and describes the amount of suspension required for the reading voice at various points in these verses (II. 3.35-38).²⁴ Stops themselves, he says, vary in length depending upon whether they conclude a phrase or a sentence. Thus the pause after *litora* need only be a short one, but a complete stop is required at the end of v. 7: "Cum illuc venero 'atque altae moenia Romae,' deponam et morabor et novum rursus exordium faciam."

Neither Quintilian nor any ancient critic mentions the fact that the end of a complete thought may be stressed in poetry as well as in prose by rhyming words which provide music, ornament and finality.

²⁴ The passage is discussed by C. P. Bill, "Vergiliana," *CP* 27 (1932) 168-71.

Several of the ancient critics, on the other hand, describe rhyme as one of the figures to be used (cautiously) in rhythmical prose conclusions, as well as at the beginning of prose clauses. Perhaps because of an absence of ancient critical endorsement, modern scholars have often been reluctant to admit the existence of intentional rhyme on a large scale in classical poetry. In the *Aeneid* and the *Metamorphoses*, however, Vergil and Ovid have concentrated both internal and consecutive rhyme before and after major sense pauses; 92 percent of the rhyming verses in the *Aeneid* are associated with sense pauses, and 88 percent in the *Metamorphoses*. Syntactical relationship—long the phenomenon which was supposed to explain away rhyme in an inflected language—actually accounts for less than half the internal and consecutive rhyme in these two poems. Thus rhyming words in verses containing the conclusions and beginnings of clauses cannot be explained by citing the conventions of the placement of syntactically related words.

The evidence is clear: rhyming words, some in syntactical relationships and some not, have been placed intentionally before and after major sense pauses by Vergil and Ovid.